



Agenda Report

File #: 18-2144

**PLANNING AND HOUSING COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT**

DATE: 10/8/2018
TO: Honorable Chair and Commissioners
FROM: Community Development Department

APPLICATION REQUEST:

CUP17-003: A conditional use permit application to establish a tennis center consisting of 11 tennis courts, one grandstand court for tournaments, a 4,633 square foot recreation building, and a 686 square foot restroom/classroom building located on the north side of Foothill Parkway and west of State Street (1695 E. Chase Drive) in the Agricultural Zone (Applicant: PHX Architecture for Rudolfo & Maria Franco, 15990 N. Greenway-Hayden Loop, Suite C-100, Scottsdale, AZ 85260).

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

That the Planning and Housing Commission recommend adoption of the Mitigated Negative Declaration and Mitigation Monitoring Plan and Resolution No. 2521 GRANTING CUP17-003, based on the findings contained in the staff report and conditions of approval.

PROJECT SITE SUMMARY

Area of Property: 4.98 acres
Existing Zoning: Agricultural (A)
Existing General Plan: Estate Residential (ER)
Existing Land Use: Vacant (formerly contained a single-family home)
Proposed Land Use: Tennis center for recreational purposes
Surrounding Zoning / Land Uses: Residential
N: R-1A / Single-family homes
E: R-A-20000 (Riverside County Unincorporated) / Single-family homes
S: Agricultural / Single-family homes
NW: ER-1 (Estate Residential 1) within the Cherokee Specific Plan (SP-90-03) / Single-family residential homes
SW: SFR (Single Family Residential) Designation within the Chase Ranch Specific Plan (SP-89-02) / Citrus orchards

BACKGROUND

The project site is 4.98 acres and located in a residential area near the intersection of Foothill Parkway and State Street. The site previously contained a single-family home which was demolished in 2006. An existing accessory building, tennis court, and concrete driveways remain on the southern portions of the site. The northern and eastern portions are vacant. Existing block walls are located along the site's two frontages.

The property owners and applicant of Conditional Use Permit 17-003 (CUP17-003) are Rudolfo and Maria Franco, who are proposing to develop the site into a tennis center for recreational purposes. The tennis center is intended to be a place where children and adults can come to learn how to play tennis with access to state-of-the-art facilities and coaching. The conditional use permit is required for this type of facility in the Agricultural Zone. The facility proposes to have a 4,633 square foot recreation building, 686 square foot restroom/classroom building, 11 practice tennis courts, and one grandstand tennis court for tournaments. In order to facilitate the development, the applicant is also seeking approval of Parcel Map 37334 and Variance 17-001. PM 37334 is intended to consolidate the site's four existing lots into one lot, and V17-003 which is a variance to reduce the site's required front yard setback along Foothill Parkway from 25 feet to zero in order to accommodate the development. All three applications are to be reviewed concurrently for approval.

The project was initially reviewed by staff as DPR16-027 and DPR17-007. It was also discussed at the Infrastructure Committee meeting held on August 3, 2016. The Committee raised concerns regarding the site's capability to provide sufficient parking, particularly during tournament events (involving off-site/shuttle provisions discussed in detail further below). Overall, the Committee was receptive to the proposal, but emphasized the applicant's need to reach out to the adjoining neighbors.

Staff has received letters from the adjacent property owners to the north at 2791 State Street and to the west at 1675 Heartland Way supporting the applicant's development (Exhibits L1-L2). The applicant has also indicated to staff that he reached out to the other surrounding property owners regarding the development and has positive feedback.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Site Plan

As shown by the applicant's site plan in Exhibit A, the project site is irregular in shape and has two street frontages. The southwest boundary borders Foothill Parkway and the east boundary borders State Street. To the north, west, and southeast are residential properties. The applicant's tennis center is designed to orient towards Foothill Parkway making this frontage the front yard while the frontage on State street is considered the side yard. The main access to the site is located on Foothill Parkway. A secondary access point is located on State Street. A parking lot and a 4,633 square foot recreation building are located on the southwestern portion of the site. Next to the recreation building is a grandstand court which will be used for tournaments. In between the recreation building and grandstand court is a viewing deck. Eleven practice tennis courts are located on the northern, eastern, and southern portions of the site. The existing accessory building located on the southeast portion of the site will be converted to restrooms and classrooms.

The development standards under the Agricultural Zone require a minimum front yard setback of 25 feet to be provided along Foothill Parkway. A side yard setback of 15 feet is also required along State Street and all interior side lot lines, and a rear yard setback of 10 feet is required along the northerly property line. The tennis center is capable of meeting all the required setbacks under the zone, except for the front yard requirement for which the applicant is seeking a variance (V17-001) to eliminate altogether in order to accommodate the center's parking lot at the front of the site. V17-001 discusses the site constraints that precipitate the variance request.

The Corona Municipal Code contains minimal development standards for tennis courts, which regulate only the tennis court enclosure and setbacks from the enclosure to the property line. Per the code, tennis courts may be enclosed by fences, walls or hedges up to a maximum height of 12 feet, provided that the enclosure is set back a minimum of three feet from the side and rear property lines. The applicant's tennis courts will be enclosed with 10-foot high chain link fences which will be set back five feet from the side and rear property lines, exceeding the minimum three-foot setback requirement.

Due to the existing topography of the site which slopes downward towards the northern property line, the parking lot and recreation building sit on the highest part of the site, level with Foothill Parkway, while the tennis courts are located approximately seven to 24 feet lower in grade. The change in grade allows the tennis courts to be tucked away into the site with minimal visibility from Foothill Parkway, which is a designated scenic corridor per the city's General Plan.

Surrounding Properties

Exhibit C shows the site's relationship to the immediate surrounding properties. The property on the west side of the project site nearest to Foothill Parkway (1675 Heartland Way) backs up to the parking lot of the tennis center and has a residential structure that is located 44 feet from the site's westerly property line. The home's pad is approximately the same level as the parking lot; however, the area where the two sites adjoin is currently a gully. The applicant will be filling in the gully to be level with both pads and reconstructing the shared wall on top of the new grade. This will allow the block wall to properly screen car headlights from the parking lot from shining into the home. Trees will also be installed between the parking lot and block wall as depicted on the applicant's landscape plan (Exhibit G) to provide additional buffering between the two sites.

The property farther northwest at 1671 Heartland Way backs onto practice courts and has a residential structure that is located 64 feet from the site's westerly property line. The property's pad is approximately 17 to 22 feet higher than the grade of the tennis courts nearest to this property. Buffering between this property and the tennis courts will be provided by the site's existing six-foot high block wall.

The property to the north at 2791 State Street contains a residential structure that is 44 feet from the site's northerly property line. The pad on this property is approximately six feet lower than the courts nearest to this property. The project site has an existing six-foot high block wall which will provide a buffer between this property and tennis courts.

Two residential properties located at 2880 and 2890 State Street are located on the southeasterly side of the project site and back onto a practice court and the auxiliary classroom building. The homes on these properties are located 24 and 77 feet from the site's southeasterly property line, and the pads are approximately at the same level as the practice court. The site has an existing six-foot high block wall constructed along the southeasterly property line with several existing mature California pepper trees which will provide a buffer between these properties and the project site.

The residential properties located across State Street to the east have residential structures that are located 88 feet and 108 feet from the site's east property line. The properties are approximately five feet lower than the grade of the tennis courts nearest to them. State Street and an existing six-foot high block wall located along the site's east property line will provide buffering between these properties and the project site.

Hours of Operation

As shown in Table A, the tennis center will be open daily. The hours of operation are for the recreation building and tennis courts. The applicant does not have tournament dates for the center yet as tournaments must be approved and sanctioned by the United States Tennis Association (USTA). However, tournaments are likely to be held on a Friday or Saturday from 8:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., and Sunday from 8:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m.

**Table A
Hours of Operation**

| Days of the Week | Hours Open |
|-------------------------|-------------------------|
| Monday through Thursday | 8:00 a.m. to 9:00 p.m. |
| Friday & Saturday | 8:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. |
| Sunday | 8:00 a.m. to 8:00 p.m. |

Floor Plans

Exhibit D depicts the floor plans for the recreation building, auxiliary building, and viewing deck at the grandstand court. The recreation building includes a gym/classroom, restrooms, offices, kitchen, lobby, and an outdoor lounge. In front of the recreation building is a one-way driveway that will allow for drop-offs. The driveway will be covered by triangular-shaped fabric shades and a steel porte-cochere at the entrance.

The auxiliary building contains restrooms and classrooms. The viewing deck is located on the southeast side of the recreation building and provides views of the grandstand court. The deck will contain tables and seats as well as an outdoor fireplace.

Elevations

Architecture for the project site is regulated by the South Corona Community Facilities Plan, which establishes Spanish Colonial as the predominant architectural theme for commercial and residential

structures in the South Corona area. However, flexibility for contemporary interpretation of this style is allowed by the plan, which also encourages variation in architecture.

The applicant is proposing a "Santa Barbara" look for the one-story recreation building, which has white stucco walls, travertine stone along the base, and dark grey barreled shaped steel roof tiles. The south elevation which will be visible from Foothill Parkway features a porte-cochere clad in Corten steel which has a decorative rustic-like appearance. The auxiliary classroom building will be remodeled to complement the architecture and colors of the recreation building. The materials and colors proposed for the buildings are harmonious with the Spanish architecture and other similar styles found throughout the South Corona area. The buildings are no more than 17 feet in height which complies with the 30-foot maximum building height limit prescribed by the Agricultural Zone. The architectural elevations are attached as Exhibits E1 and E2.

Access and Circulation

Vehicular access to the tennis center will be provided by two existing driveways on Foothill Parkway. The easterly driveway will operate as the main entrance and will allow for ingress-only (right-in) driveway. No exiting will be permitted from this driveway. A new deceleration lane will be constructed in front of the driveway to allow vehicles to enter the site without impeding westbound traffic on Foothill Parkway. The westerly driveway on Foothill Parkway will operate as an egress-only (right-out) driveway. Vehicles will not be able to make left-turn movements from Foothill Parkway into the site as Foothill Parkway contains a raised center median in front of the project site.

An existing driveway on State Street will be utilized as a secondary access point for the tennis center. The driveway is designed as a one-way entry-only driveway and will be gated and accessible only to staff and a shuttle bus/van traveling from an off-site parking lot located at Santiago High School, which is located approximately 1,600 feet west of the site on Foothill Parkway. While the tennis center will have its own parking lot onsite, an agreement between the applicant and school will allow competitors and spectators attending tournaments at the tennis center be able to utilize the school's parking lot on tournament days in the event overflow parking is needed. Tournament attendees would be shuttled from the school to the tennis center via California Avenue, Taber Street, and State Street where the shuttle would enter the site from the secondary driveway located on State Street. The shuttle will not be able take a direct route from the school to the project site via Foothill Parkway because Foothill Parkway presently contains a raised concrete median in front of the project site that would prevent left-turn movements into the project site. The agreement with Santiago High School and the shuttle route are attached as Exhibits F1 and F2, respectively.

The northern half-width of Foothill Parkway adjacent to the project site is constructed with curb and gutter, sidewalk, and a 21-foot wide landscape parkway. No additional public improvements are required. The west half of State Street adjacent to the project site is currently missing curb and gutter, sidewalk, and landscaped parkway. The applicant is required to construct the missing public improvements which includes completing the roadway paving and curb and gutter in addition to a landscaped parkway and sidewalk at an overall width of 12 feet.

Parking

Per the parking requirements under Chapter 17.76 of the CMC, parking spaces are required to serve the buildings and tennis courts. The recreation and classroom buildings are required to be provided

with one parking space for every 250 square feet of floor area. Based on the size of the buildings, a total of 22 parking spaces are required. For the 12 tennis courts, one parking space is required for every three courts, which results in 36 parking spaces required. In total, 58 parking spaces are required. The facility's parking lot is capable of accommodating 60 parking spaces. Therefore, the project's parking complies with the parking requirements of the municipal code. Also, as previously discussed, the applicant has obtained an agreement with Santiago High School securing additional off-site parking in the event overflow parking is needed during tournament days (Exhibit F1).

Easements

The project site contains an existing 40-foot wide MWD (Metropolitan Water District) easement which bisects the middle of the site in an east-west direction. The easement is for the construction and maintenance of a MWD pipeline and is required to be protected in place. Access to the easement is currently provided by an existing driveway located on State Street. The access will be gated and accessible only by MWD personnel for maintenance and Corona Fire Department as a fire emergency access.

An eight-foot wide easement for pipeline and incidental purposes in favor of the City of Corona is located along the project site's southeasterly perimeter. The proposed project will not affect the easement, which will be protected in place.

Landscaping

Landscaping will be installed throughout development as shown on the applicant's conceptual landscape plan attached as Exhibit G. The plan proposes to install seven different types of tree species throughout the parking lot and tennis courts. A variety of shrubs and groundcover will also be planted to enhance the grounds. Street trees and parkway landscaping are only required along State Street as Foothill Parkway is already landscaped. The landscaping along State Street is required to be installed per the City's parkway planting requirement. The conceptual landscape plan indicates the use of water efficient irrigation system and California-friendly plant materials for the project and parkways which comply with the City's landscape requirements under Chapter 17.70 of the Corona Municipal Code.

Fences and Walls

Per the applicant's fence and wall plan attached as Exhibit H, the project site is surrounded by existing six-foot high block walls on all perimeters except for the front perimeter along Foothill Parkway which has an existing five-foot high block wall with decorative pilasters. The applicant will be maintaining the six-foot high walls along the west, north, and east perimeters. Through an agreement with the neighboring property owner to the west, the wall along the west perimeter near Foothill Parkway will be reconstructed as the applicant will be raising the grade along that perimeter in order to set the block wall at a higher grade to screen car headlights from the facility's parking lot from shining into the neighboring residence.

The applicant will be lowering the five-foot high wall along Foothill Parkway to three feet high and topped with two feet of wrought iron for an overall height of five feet. Also, the existing gates at both driveways on Foothill Parkway will be removed.

The entrance to the MWD easement will be gated as well as the shuttle entrance on State Street. The tennis courts will be fenced with 10-foot high chain link fence.

Signage

A monument sign is proposed on the site's Foothill Parkway frontage as depicted on Exhibit I. The monument sign is three feet and seven inches tall and has an area of 66 square feet. Monument signs in the Agricultural Zone are limited to no more than three feet tall and four square feet in size. However, the property is not being used for Agricultural purposes, but more as a quasi-commercial use by this conditional use permit. Therefore, the conditional use permit will include the approval of the sign program presented by the applicant, which is consistent with the signage regulations associated with commercial properties.

Lighting

A photometric analysis was prepared for the project (MSA Engineering Consultants, May 5, 2017) to analyze the project's on-site lighting for compliance with the city's performance standard for glare and to ensure that the on-site lighting will not be a nuisance to the surrounding existing residences. The applicant is proposing to install 20-foot high light poles with hooded fixtures around the tennis courts. Each practice court will have six light fixtures (three on each side). The grandstand court will have eight light fixtures (four on each side). Four light poles will be installed in the parking lot. The photometric analysis demonstrates that the project's lighting would be in compliance with the city's regulations pertaining to glare per Section 17.84.070 of the Corona Municipal Code, which states that "all areas of exterior lighting shall be designed to direct light downward with minimal spillover onto adjacent residences, sensitive land uses, and open space." The analysis showed that the proposed exterior lighting would result in minimal to no glare spillover onto the adjacent properties surrounding the project site. The lighting plan and photometric study are attached as Exhibits J1-J2.

Furthermore, as the applicant describes in Exhibit K, the courts will have a local control station that controls the lighting within each court. The lighting will turn on only when a court is occupied and switch off automatically if no motion is detected for a set amount of time or if the time set on the court's control station runs out. The courts will also be controlled by a master time clock function which will limit the time the courts are allowed to be turned on so that court lights can only be turned on during operational hours (refer to Table A). It should also be noted that the tennis courts will be at a lower grade than Foothill Parkway and the properties to the west as discussed in the Surrounding Properties section of this report. Also, no light poles will be installed immediately at the northerly and southeasterly property lines where the abutting residential pads are at the same level or lower than the tennis courts. For the property to the north of the site, the nearest light poles to this property will be located approximately 60 feet from the site's northerly property line. For the properties to the southeast, the nearest light poles will be located approximately 35 feet from the site's southeasterly property line. Therefore, mitigation pertaining to lighting and glare was not warranted as impacts are expected to be less than significant. Lighting is discussed in further detail in Section 13 of the Mitigated Negative Declaration attached as Exhibit N.

Noise

Tennis court activity was analyzed for noise (LSA, July 2017). Noise generated from the use of the tennis courts would consist of people conversing or yelling and the sound of racquets and tennis balls intermittently. No loudspeakers have been proposed, and they are prohibited by the Conditions of Approval (Exhibit B). Tournaments at the grandstand court are expected to generate a noise level of 65 dBA L_{eq} from crowd noise measured at 75 feet from the noise source. The nearest off-site sensitive land use is the backyard of a single-family home located approximately 200 feet to the south of the grandstand court. The crowd noise would be attenuated by distance and buffer walls to 57 dBA L_{eq} at the residence.

Typical hourly noise levels associated with activities at the practice tennis courts are expected to be approximately 58 dBA L_{eq} at a distance of 50 feet from the center of the court. There are seven practice courts located on the northern portion of the project site. Under the worst-case scenario, all seven tennis courts would be occupied at the same time, and the cumulative noise level would be approximately 66 dBA L_{eq} at a distance of 50 feet from the center of the seven tennis courts. The closest off-site sensitive land use is the backyard of a single-family home located approximately 120 feet north to the center of these courts. The cumulative noise level from the tennis courts would be attenuated by distance and buffer walls to 58 dBA.

The reason noise from the grandstand and practice courts is expected to be attenuated to 57 dBA and 58 dBA, respectively, at the nearest residence is because the project site has existing six-foot high block walls built along the project boundaries, which provide an approximately five dBA noise reduction to the nearest residences. The noise would be reduced to 52 dBA and 53 dBA which would not exceed the city's stationary source standard of 55 dBA established for residential properties. Therefore, mitigation pertaining to noise was not warranted. Additional discussions regarding noise is included in Section 10 of the Mitigated Negative Declaration attached as Exhibit N.

ENVIRONMENTAL ANALYSIS

Per Section 15070 of the State Guidelines for Implementing the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and Section 6.02 of the City's Local Guidelines, a Mitigated Negative Declaration was prepared for the project because the initial study identified that the project's potentially significant effects to the environment are capable of being mitigated to less than significant. Therefore, based on the project mitigation identified in the Mitigated Negative Declaration, there is no substantial evidence, in light of the whole record before the City, that the project may have a significant effect on the environment. The Initial Study and Mitigated Negative Declaration prepared for the project are attached as Exhibit N.

FISCAL IMPACT

The applicant has paid all the required application processing fees

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

A 20-day public notice was mailed to all property owners within a 500-foot radius of the project site, as well as advertised in the Sentinel Weekly News newspaper and posted at the project site. As of

the preparation of this report staff has received written responses from a resident expressing concerns regarding the project's potential parking impacts to the surrounding neighborhood (Exhibit M).

STAFF ANALYSIS

The tennis center is proposed to be established in the Agricultural Zone which is allowed provided that the use is approved by a conditional use permit. The facility is capable of complying with all applicable development standards prescribed by the Corona Municipal Code, except for the front yard setback which the applicant is seeking a variance for. The Santa Barbara architecture of the buildings is appealing and includes materials and colors that are harmonious with the Spanish architecture predominantly found throughout the South Corona area. The project is designed with the tennis courts tucked away towards the back of the building with minimal visibility from Foothill Parkway, a designed scenic corridor in Corona. Block walls and landscaping where needed provide buffering between the tennis center and surrounding residential properties. Potential noise and lighting impacts associated with the tennis courts were analyzed per CEQA resulting in less than significant impacts warranting no mitigation measures.

Development of the project site will improve an existing underutilized vacant property. The tennis facility has been designed to be compatible with the surrounding area. The applicant will construct the necessary public improvements along the west half of State Street with curb and gutter, sidewalk, and parkway landscaping. The street improvements are desirable and necessary for the safety of the community. Finally, the development contributes to General Plan Policies 1.1.1, 1.1.2, and 1.1.3, which encourage Corona as being a community that contains various uses to support the diverse needs of Corona's residents, enhance the City's fiscal viability, and to minimize the need for Corona residents to travel to surrounding communities for recreational services. Therefore, based on the following findings and conditions of approval, CUP17-003 is recommended for approval.

FINDINGS OF APPROVAL FOR CUP17-003

1. An initial study (environmental assessment) has been conducted by the City of Corona so as to evaluate the potential for adverse environmental impacts. The environmental assessment identifies potentially significant effects on the environment, but:
 - a. *The project applicant has agreed to revise the project to avoid these significant effects or to mitigate the effects to a point where it is clear that no significant environmental effects would occur, as reflected in the Conditions of Approval attached as Exhibit B.*
 - b. *There is no substantial evidence before the City that the revised project may have a significant environmental effect.*
2. All the conditions necessary for granting a Conditional Use Permit as set forth in Section 17.92.110 of the Corona Municipal Code do exist in reference to CUP17-003 for the following reasons:
 - a. *The proposal will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, convenience and general welfare, and will be in harmony with the various elements and objectives of the City's General Plan because the project meets or exceeds the development standards*

of the Corona Municipal Code in terms of setbacks, parking, landscaping and overall site design. The applicant is obtaining a variance for the reduced front yard setback, and adequate vehicular access is provided from Foothill Parkway and State Street. Both streets are capable of accommodating the level of traffic associated with the project.

- b. The proposed land use is not detrimental to other existing and permitted uses in the general area of the project site because the site is capable of accommodating the proposed tennis center as shown in Exhibit A, and the project's potential environmental impacts have been analyzed per CEQA. The project also relates properly to the existing adjacent streets because the streets are fully improved or required to be improved with the development to safely serve the site and the surrounding community.*
- c. The development will not be detrimental to the other existing and permitted uses in the area as the project has been designed and is conditioned to comply with the applicable city ordinances and codes to ensure quality and a safely planned development.*

3. The proposal is consistent with the General Plan for the following reason:

- a. The project promotes General Plan Policies 1.1.1, 1.1.2, and 1.1.3, which encourage Corona as being a community that contains various uses to support the diverse needs of Corona's residents, enhance the City's fiscal viability, and to minimize the need for Corona residents to travel to surrounding communities for recreational services.*

4. The proposal is consistent with the Agricultural Zone for the following reason:

- a. The proposed project complies with the Agricultural Zone because tennis centers are permitted in the Agricultural Zone by a conditional use permit. Also, other than the variance (V17-001) pertaining to the front yard setback, the project is capable of meeting the development standards of the Corona Municipal Code and Agricultural Zone in terms of building setback, building height limitation, parking, and landscaping, and overall site design.*

PREPARED BY: SANDRA YANG, SENIOR PLANNER

REVIEWED BY: TERRI MANUEL, PLANNING MANAGER

SUBMITTED BY: JOANNE COLETTA, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

EXHIBITS

1. Resolution No. 2521
2. Locational and zoning map
3. Exhibit A - Site Plan
4. Exhibit B - Conditions of Approval
5. Exhibit C - Exhibit of Surrounding Properties
6. Exhibit D - Floor Plans
7. Exhibit E1-E2 - Elevations
8. Exhibit F1-F2 - Off-site Parking Agreement and Shuttle route
9. Exhibit G - Landscape Plan
10. Exhibit H - Fence and Wall Plan
11. Exhibit I - Signage
12. Exhibit J1-J2 - Lighting Plan and Photometric Study
13. Exhibit K - Applicant's letter dated December 13, 2017
14. Exhibit L1-L2 - Letters of Support from 2791 State Street and 1675 Heartland Way
15. Exhibit M - Public Correspondence
16. Exhibit N - Environmental Documentation
17. Exhibit O - GIS Aerial Map

Case Planner: Sandra Yang (951) 736-2262