



Staff Report

File #: 24-0211

REQUEST FOR CITY COUNCIL ACTION

DATE: 03/20/2024

TO: Honorable Mayor and City Council Members

FROM: Planning & Development Department

SUBJECT:

PRECISE PLAN 2023-0008 TO REVIEW THE SITE PLAN, ARCHITECTURE, FENCING AND LANDSCAPING FOR 19 SINGLE FAMILY DWELLING UNITS PROPOSED ON 4.73 ACRES LOCATED ON THE NORTHWEST CORNER OF TAYLOR AVENUE AND CITRON STREET IN THE R-1-8.4 ZONE (SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL, 8,400 SQUARE FEET MINIMUM LOT SIZE) (APPLICANT: BRYAN BERGERON, FOREMOST PACIFIC GROUP)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

This staff report asks the City Council to affirm the decision by the Planning and Housing Commission and approve Precise Plan 2023-0008 for the site design and architecture of 19 single-family dwellings associated with Tentative Tract Map 37980. The project site is located at the northwest corner of Citron Street and Taylor Avenue on 4.73 acres in the R-1-8.4 zone.

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

That the City Council affirm the Planning and Housing Commission's action granting Precise Plan 2023-0008, based on the findings contained in the staff report and conditions of approval.

BACKGROUND & HISTORY:

The project site is an infill property surrounded by existing single-family dwellings and public infrastructure. TTM 37980 was approved by the City Council on January 5, 2022, to subdivide the 4.73 acres into 19 lots. The zoning of the property is R-1-8.4, which requires a minimum lot size of 8,400 square feet. The lots within this subdivision range from 8,400 square feet to 14,033 square feet.

Planning and Housing Commission Meeting

The Planning and Housing Commission at its meeting on February 12, 2024, held a public hearing on PP2023-0008. The Commission heard public testimony from the residents in the adjacent neighborhoods regarding the dislike of the Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs) proposed as part of the

project, the two-story houses, and having the project’s perimeter wall adjacent to existing block walls of the existing houses and thus creating a gap between the walls.

At the close of the public hearing, the Commission approved PP2023-0008 based on the following:

- The ADUs are not subject to discretionary review per the state’s ADU law and the Commission does not have the authority to prohibit the construction of ADUs that meet state law.
- The ADUs were shown for informational purposes and were technically not required to be shown as part of the project.
- The zoning does not restrict two-story houses and the seven single-story houses shown in the project were strategically placed adjacent to existing properties that had a single-story house.
- The architectural style of the houses does not need to be identical to the architectural style of the existing houses which are from the 1960s.
- The Commission added conditions of approval that required the developer to collaborate with adjacent property owners on wall removals where project walls are proposed, and the developer shall discuss with the Community Services Department the possibility of keeping the existing palm trees on Taylor Avenue.

City Council Meeting

The City Council at its meeting on March 6, 2024, decided to set PP2023-0008 for review. One general comment made by the Council during the meeting is understanding what is within the Council’s jurisdiction to review under this application based on some of the comments from the nearby residents. Below is a summary of the discretionary review allowed under a precise plan application.

Precise Plan Review	Description
Compliance with the zoning.	Development standards such as building setbacks, height, and lot coverage.
Compliance with the General Plan.	Land use designation of the property.
Compliance with residential design guidelines.	The guidelines complement the mandatory site development regulations contained in the city’s Zoning Code. The guidelines do not describe or require a particular architectural style and focus more on compatibility with the surrounding character of the neighborhood which includes building style, form, color, building materials, and rooflines.
Compliance with landscape requirements.	Quantity of trees, shrubs, and ground cover.
Compliance with perimeter fencing.	Material and height.
Compliance with public improvements and city standards.	Street standards, driveways, street trees, etc.

ADU State Law

ADUs are regulated by California Government Code Sections 65852.2 and 65852.22. The following is a summary of the law.

- Shall be permitted in any residential zone or mixed use zone that allows residential.
- Shall meet the development standards of the zone except that the side and rear yard setback to the property line shall be allowed at four feet.
- Shall not be limited to a minimum lot size.
- Shall not be counted toward the maximum density allowed by the General Plan.
- Shall be ministerially approved (not subject to discretionary review).
- Shall not exceed a size of 1,200 square feet if detached.
- Shall not exceed 50% of the floor area of the primary unit if attached.
- No development standard other than a setback of four feet from the side or rear property line shall prevent the construction of an 800 square-foot ADU.
- Shall not be limited to owner occupancy.
- Requires one uncovered parking space on the property.
- Shall meet architectural design guidelines reviewed through the ministerial process.

ANALYSIS:

Existing Neighborhood

The project is an infill property that is surrounded by single-family homes constructed in the early 1960s to early 1970s. The surrounding houses are single story with the building materials of the houses consisting mostly of flat asphalt shingle roofs, and the exterior facades consisting of stucco or wood paneling with brick or stone accent features or columns. The houses also have street front-facing garages with a few houses having a street side-on garage. The existing houses have front yard building setbacks ranging from 23 feet to 28 feet along Taylor Avenue and Citron Street.

Project Design and Architecture

Due to the age of the existing neighborhood, the single-family houses proposed by the applicant are not of the same architectural style but do provide building materials that are consistent with the types of materials used in the existing neighborhood. The applicant has proposed four architectural styles for the development which include French Country, Tuscany, Spanish, and Craftsman. Due to some of the comments made on the architecture at the Planning and Housing Commission, the applicant is proposing to remove the Spanish architectural style from the development, since this style is not regularly used in the immediate area.

The floor plans include single-story and two-story units. The following summarizes the sizes of the floor plans.

One-story units:

- Plans 1A and 1C - 1,475 square feet living area with 3 bedrooms/2 baths, 436 square foot two car garage, and 244 square foot side-attached garage.

Two-story units:

- Plan 2D - 1,592 square feet living area with 3 bedrooms/2.5 baths, 435 square foot two car garage, and 265 square foot detached garage.

- Plans 3A and 3C - 1,798 square feet living area with 3 bedrooms/3 baths, 419 square foot two car garage, and 265 square foot detached garage.

The initial Spanish design (Plan 2B) will be replaced with either the Craftsman or Tuscan elevation on the site plan.

The City’s Residential Development Design Guidelines are intended as a reference to assist in the design of new residential development to provide high quality development. The guidelines complement the mandatory site development regulations contained in the city’s Zoning Code. The guidelines do not describe or require a particular architectural style and focus more on compatibility with the surrounding character of the neighborhood which includes building style, form, color, building materials, and rooflines.

The table below provides a summary of how the project is meeting several of the guidelines recommended by the City’s Residential Development Design Guidelines.

Table 1 Design Guidelines Summary

Residential Development Design Guideline	Proposed Development
The setback of structures shall comply with the appropriate zoning regulation, however, the minimum setback for all homes is not recommended. Front yard setbacks shall be varied to create a different and unique streetscape.	The R-1-8.4 zone requires a minimum front yard setback of 25 feet. Lots 15 -19 along Citron Street and Lots 10-14 along Taylor Avenue have front yard setbacks ranging from 25 feet to 30 feet, and the front yard setbacks along the project’s internal street range from 25 feet to 31 feet.
The design of structures should be varied in a development to create variety and interest. The presence of two-story and one-story split elevation homes creates interest in a neighborhood. A minimum of 15 percent of the units should be single story.	The applicant is proposing seven, one-story floor plans, which result in 37% of the total number of units within the project. The one-story floor plans are also placed adjacent to the existing single-family dwellings in the adjoining neighborhood.
No more than 60% of the building elevation facing a street shall be devoted to garages on lots of 8,400 sq. ft. in size and larger. This may be increased to 65 percent if the garage is recessed.	The garage on the front elevation of the houses is 60% of the building elevation.
Garage doors should be recessed to allow for shadow and depth.	The two-car garage on the two-story units is recessed 4 feet from the front of the house and the detached single-car garage is recessed 12 feet to 14 feet from the front of the house.

<p>Garages shall have a single-story mass at the front of the structure with the option to transition to a two-story mass.</p>	<p>The two-story Craftsman has a split-level appearance with a single-story roof above the garage that elevates to a two-story at one end of the house. The French Country and Tuscany have a single-story element along the front of the home and a roof above the two-car attached garage. The second floor is recessed 12 feet from the front of the garage roof.</p>
<p>Homes should incorporate varied rooflines and projections. Two-story homes should include single-story elements in the design.</p>	<p>Same as above.</p>
<p>All elevations visible to the public should incorporate accent materials sufficient to establish architectural style and character. Acceptable materials include: brick, river rock, flagstone, wood siding and wood or stucco trim.</p>	<p>The exterior materials of the houses vary and include stucco plaster, brick trim, stone veneer, foam trim, potshel, shutter and concrete roof tiles (flat and barrel shape).</p>

<p>New development in existing neighborhoods should incorporate distinctive architectural characteristics of the surrounding development. This may include window and door detailing, decoration, materials, roof style and pitch, finished floor height, porches, bay windows, etc.</p>	<p>The houses will have a stucco plaster finish and window detailing such as trim, shutter or potshel, a brick or stone wainscot on the ground floor, and decorative metal garage doors. Additionally, the single-story French Country has a hipped roof at a pitch of 5:12, and the Tuscan has a hipped and gable roof at a pitch of 4:12. The two-story Craftsman and Tuscan has a hipped and gable roof with a roof pitch of 5:12 and 6:12, and the French Country has a hipped roof with a pitch of 5:12 and 6:12. The existing houses in the neighborhood include stucco plaster or wood paneling exterior, wood trims around the windows with some elevations having a stone or wood paneled wainscot and decorative metal garage doors. The existing houses on Taylor Avenue have either a gable or hipped roof that look to have a roof pitch of 4:12 with some houses having a sloped pitched roof with a pitch of 5:12 along the front. The houses on Citron Street have either a hipped or Dutch gable roof that looks to have a roof pitch of 4:12.</p>
--	---

Height

The height of the single-story dwelling is 18 feet and the two-story dwellings are no greater than 26 feet. Both meet the building height limit of 25 feet for single-story dwellings and 30 feet for two-story dwellings.

Lot Coverage

The R-1-8.4 zone allows a lot coverage of up to 40% for properties with a single-story dwelling and up to 35% for two-story dwellings. All lots adhere to the lot coverage allowed by the R-1-8.4 zone. The lot coverage for each lot based on the proposed floor plan is shown in Table 2.

Table 2 Lot Coverage Summary

Lot No.	Lot Size (SF)	Plan Type	Square footage (Ground Floor with Garage)	Lot Coverage
1	8,400	Single Story	2,155	27%
2	8,461	Single Story	2,155	25%
3	8,433	Single Story	2,155	26%

4	9,823	Single Story	2,155	22%
5	11,432	Two Story	1,436	13%
6	14,034	Two Story	1,586	11%
7	10,085	Two Story	1,436	14%
8	8,821	Two Story	1,586	18%
9	10,010	Single Story	2,155	22%
10	9,190	Single Story	2,155	23%
11	8,402	Two Story	1,586	19%
12	8,402	Two Story	1,436	17%
13	8,402	Two Story	1,586	19%
14	8,400	Two Story	1,436	17%
15	8,920	Two Story	1,436	16%
16	9,002	Two Story	1,586	18%
17	8,999	Two Story	1,436	16%
18	8,997	Two Story	1,586	18%
19	8,994	Single Story	2,155	24%

Accessory Dwelling Units (ADU)

The applicant intends to construct a detached accessory dwelling unit (ADU) on each lot. Per state law, ADUs are not subject to discretionary review by a city and only require ministerial review. The ADUs are shown on the site plan for informational purposes only and will be reviewed separately as part of the city’s building plan review process before the issuance of a building permit. The ADUs are 1,176 square feet and are located to the rear of the property. The third car garage shown on the site plan for each lot is also intended for the ADU.

Per state law, the maximum size of an ADU is 1,200 square feet. Additionally, no development standard, other than a building setback of four feet from the side and rear property line, shall prevent the construction of an 800 square foot ADU.

The lot coverage for each lot with the ADU continues to adhere to the lot coverage allowed by the R-1-8.4 zone. The lots with a single-story plan and ADU will have a lot coverage of 40% and lots with a two-story floor plan and ADU will have a lot coverage ranging from 20% to 34%. The lot coverage will be reviewed at the time of plan review for the ADU.

Landscaping

The conceptual landscape plan shows drought tolerate plantings for the front yards. The front yards will have a minimum of two, 24-inch box trees, shrubs and groundcover, and wood mulch, which is consistent with the state’s drought tolerance landscape standards.

Since the Planning Commission meeting, city staff and the developer discussed the relocation of the palm trees on Taylor Avenue. Thirteen palm trees exist within the right-of-way and will need to be

relocated to accommodate the widening of the street adjacent to the project site. Eight of the palm trees will be relocated within the new parkway along Taylor Avenue adjacent to the project site with five palm trees being removed due to the placement of new driveways along this street. The five trees being removed will need to be replaced at a ratio of 2 to 1 on the project site within the parkway or elsewhere in the city.

Walls and Fencing

The project provides decorative split-face block walls at a height of six feet around the perimeters of the project and the interior walls of each lot, which is consistent with the city's ordinance. Vinyl fencing will be used to separate the primary dwelling from the ADU within each lot to create private yards for each unit within each lot. Retaining walls varying in height from 2.5 feet to 5 feet will be constructed along the project's west and north perimeters adjacent to the existing properties and Lots 1,2, 9, and 10.

Easement

A 20-foot-wide public drainage easement will be established along the north property line of Lots 9 and 10 creating a separation from the adjoining lots located to the north. The easement will provide for an underground pipe to allow stormwater to drain from Lorraine Drive to Taylor Street.

Access and Circulation

Taylor Avenue and Citron Street are not fully widened to a collector street standard adjacent to the project site. The applicant is required to widen and improve both streets according to the city's collector street standard, which requires a half street right of way width of 34 feet from the street's centerline. This improvement was required with the approval of TTM 37980 and will need to be constructed at the time of development of the project site. The internal streets are required to be constructed according to the city's local street standard which requires an overall right of way width of 60 feet. Sidewalk and parkway landscaping will also be constructed with roadway improvements.

Vehicular access from Lots 10 through 19 will be provided from Taylor Avenue and Citron Street. Interior lots, Lots 1 through 9, will take vehicular access from the newly extended Lorraine Drive and Susanne Street which currently dead-end at the project site from the north and west.

FINANCIAL IMPACT:

The applicant paid the application processing fees of \$8,716.14 to cover the cost of the Precise Plan.

ENVIRONMENTAL ANALYSIS:

PP2023-0008 is associated with TTM 37980, which was approved by the City Council in January 2022. TTM 37980 qualified as an infill exemption per Section 15332 of the State Guidelines for Implementing the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and Section 3.28 of the City's Local CEQA Guidelines. Per Section 15332, if a project is consistent with the site's General Plan and Zoning designations and applicable plan policies; is less than five (5) acres in size; is surrounded by urban uses; has no habitat for endangered, rare or threatened species; would not result in significant traffic, noise, air quality or water quality effects; and the site is adequately served by utilities and public services, the project would be exempt from CEQA.

Per the Public Works Traffic Impact Study Guidelines, a traffic impact analysis is not required if a project does not generate more than 50 trips in the A.M. and P.M. peak hours. A traffic memo for TTM 37980 was prepared by Kunzman and Associates Traffic Engineers and the trip generation rates were approximately 179 average daily trips, with 14 trips in the A.M. peak hours and 19 trips in the P.M. peak hours.

Both streets are collector streets and according to the traffic counts obtained in 2019, both streets operate below the maximum capacity of 13,000 average daily trips.

- Citron Street (Lincoln to Buena Vista Avenues): 2,300 average daily trips.
- Taylor Avenue (Olive to Citron Streets): 2,200 average daily trips.

Additionally, the General Plan designation of the project site has not changed since the preparation of the City's General Plan, therefore, the future development of this site was calculated into the city's overall growth.

A biological analysis and air quality screening letter was also prepared for TTM 37980. The biological analysis evaluated the potential removal of the mature palm trees on Taylor Avenue. Bird breeding season generally occurs February 1 through August 31. Therefore, the removal of the palm trees should occur after the breeding season, which is from September 1 through January 31

The air quality screening letter assessed construction and operational emissions. Using the CalEEMod 2016.3.2 air quality model, daily construction and operational emissions for the project are below the total emission thresholds allowed by the South Coast Air Quality Management District's Air Quality Thresholds.

PP2023-0008 is a subsequent entitlement associated with TTM 37980 and qualifies as an infill exemption per Section 15332 of CEQA Guidelines. The analysis prepared for TTM 37980 also pertains to future entitlements associated with the project site.

PLANNING AND HOUSING COMMISSION ACTION:

At its meeting of February 12, 2024, the Planning and Housing Commission considered the subject matter and took the following action:

Motion was made, seconded (Alexander/Longwell) and carried unanimously, with Vice Chair Vernon and Commissioner Siqueland absent, that the Planning and Housing Commission adopt Resolution No. 2626 granting PP2023-0008, based on the findings contained in the staff report and conditions of approval. The minutes of the Planning and Housing Commission meeting are included as Exhibit 4.

PREPARED BY: JOANNE COLETTA, PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

Attachments:

1. Exhibit 1 - Locational and zoning map
2. Exhibit 2 - Site plan for PP2023-0008
3. Exhibit 3 - Planning and Housing Commission staff report
4. Exhibit 4 - Minutes of the Planning and Housing Commission meeting of February 12, 2024